Voluntary Local Review (VLR) of Emboreet village, Manyara, Tanzania

Asia Majid, Gelas Rubakula



Copyright © ICLD 2023

Frontpage Photo: Emboreet village Photo credit: All photos in this report are credited to the authors and the collaborators mentioned under "Acknowledgements".

ISBN: 978-91-86725-65-5

Abstract

The United Nations Agenda 2030 contains 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) with 169 targets to address global social, environmental, and economic challenges by 2030, of which many must be implemented at the local level. Voluntary Local Reviews have gained prominence as a means for local and regional governments to assess SDG progress and remaining challenges. Citizen and community engagement in SDG implementation have been recognized as instrumental in achieving the goals and targets. This report presents the findings of a Voluntary Local Review conducted in Emboreet village, Tanzania. The objective was to assess the localization of Agenda 2030, explore the involvement of citizens and other social actors in SDG implementation, and understand their perceptions of the efforts made in achieving the SDGs. The research employed a Community Participatory Action Research methodology to ensure active community participation and collaboration. It reviews thirteen SDGs as a combination of those adapted by the Emboreet village from the Tanzania Vision 2025 and priorities of community stakeholders.

Acknowledgements

We extend our heartfelt gratitude to ICLD for their unwavering support, which played a pivotal role in the successful realization of this Voluntary Local Review (VLR). The Emboreet Village VLR project was skillfully guided under the supervision of Dr. Gelas Rubakula from the University of Dar es Salaam, Institute of Development Studies. The primary research for the VLR was undertaken by Miss Asia Majid from the University of Dar es Salaam, Institute of Development Studies,Dr. Rubakula, Mr. John Kitonga, ICLD Mentor, and Mr. Alois Porokwa from Emboreet village itself.

Our gratitude further extends to the Simanjiro District Council, the Emboreet Village Council, various Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), Emboreet's primary and secondary schools, and the entire Emboreet community. Their active and enthusiastic participation significantly enriched this VLR process, ensuring its depth and relevance. In addition, we express our deepest appreciation to all contributors who have played a role in bringing this project to fruition.

Table of contents

Executive Summary	9
Introduction	10
Objective of the VLR	10
Context of Emboreet ward	11
Methodology	12
Institutional mechanisms	12
participatory approach	12
Data collection and processing	12
Data analysis	13
Indicator selection	13
SDG Prioritization and implementation	14
Policy and enabling environment	14
Priorities of the local government and stakeholder	
communities	15
Integration of key principles including leave no one	
behind, gender equality, participation and accountability	16
Progress on goals and targets	20
Challenges and needs	30
Priority Needs	32
Local Democracy and the VLR	33
Efforts made by the Emboreet local government	33
Community perceptions on SGD localizationt	34
Community perception on participation in monitoring progress	34
Integration, monitoring and implementation	35
Summary of findings	35
Means of implementation	35
Conclusion	36
Next steps	36
References	38

List of tables	Table 1. Total annual budget of LGA and CSOs on prioritizedSDGs in Emboreet village20		
	Table 2. Emboreet community awareness of the efforts made by local government to implement SDGs	33	
List of figures	Figure 1. A map showing Emboreet village location	11	
	Figure 2. Emboreet secondary school	11	
	Figure 3. Cow grazing as one of the main economic activities at Emboreet village	ge 11	
	Figure 4. FGD session in Emboreet village	13	
	Figure 5. Link between Tanzania FYDP and SGDs	15	
	Figure 6. SDGS priorities at Emboreet village by community members	16	
	Figure 7. Men and Women engagement in Economic activities	17	
	Figure 8. How the Emboreet community engage in SDG implementation	18	
	Figure 9 .Community awareness on existence of Community-led initiatives and projects at Emboreet village	18	
	Figure 10. Community awareness on local government collaboration and partnership with other development stakeholders	18	
	Figure 11. Monitoring, evaluation and reporting mechanisms of SDG		
	implementation in Emboreet village	19	
	Figure 12. Community awareness of SDG reporting implementation at Emboreet village	19	
	Figure 13. Illustrates the level of engagement of community members in activities aimed at poverty eradication in Emboreet village	21	
	Figure 14. Livestock keeping to implement SDG 2 at Emboreet village	22	
	Figure 15. Emboreet village health Center	23	
	Figure 16. Access to education between men and women in Emboreet village	24	
	Figure 17. Cultural norms affecting survey participation generates a misleading graph on sex distribution in education in Emboreet village	g 25	
	Figure 18. Water supply tanks and a borehole in Emboreet village	25	
	Figure 19. One of the main roads in Emboreet village	27	
	Figure 20. Challenges affecting SDG implementation by LGA and CSOs	31	
	Figure 21. Challenges affecting SDG implementation by Emboreet community members	31	
	Figure 22. Ways to promote SDG implementation	32	
	Figure 23. Significance of community participation	32	
	Figure 24. Community awareness on SDG implementation by LGA in Emboreet village	33	
	Figure 25. Community perception on SDG localization	34	
	Figure 26. Community engagement ways in VLR	34	
	Figure 27. Community response of VLR enhancing accountability	34	
	Figure 28. Community awareness of the assessment of SDG-implementation progress	34	

_

-

Abbreviations and acronyms

VLR	Voluntary local review
VNR	Voluntary National Review
VSNR	Voluntary sub-national Review
LGA	Local Government Authority
ICLD	Swedish International Centre for Local Democracy
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
CBPR	Community Based Participatory Research
CSO	Civil Society Organizations
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
FGD	Focus group discussions
SPSS	Statistical Package for Social Sciences
NBS	Tanzania national bureau of statistics
UN	United Nations
IDS	Institute of Development Studies
TACCEI	Tanzania Conservation and Community Empowerment Initiative
NGO	Non-Government Organization
USD	United States Dollars
SELA	Simanjiro Citizen Empowerment and Legal Assistance Organization
SPIDD	Discipleship Development Organization (SPIDD)
MWECCAP	Maasai Women Maasai Women Empowerment and Climate Change Adaptation Project
FEMI	Family Empowerment Ministries
SPSS	Statistical Package for the Social Sciences
TANESCO	Tanzania Electricity Supply Company
MRALG	Regional Administration and Local Government
WDC	ward development committee
USAID	U.S. Agency for International Development
	~ · · ·

Preface



By Johan Lilja, Secretary General, Swedish International Centre for Local Democracy

The mission of the Swedish International Centre for Local Democracy (ICLD) is to contribute to poverty reduction by promoting local democracy. In order to fulfil this, we promote and encourage decentralised cooperation through municipal partnerships programme; adding capacity-building through our international training programmes; and investing in relevant research and creating important research networks. ICLD documents and publishes key lessons learned from our ongoing activities, initiates and funds relevant research, engages in scholarly networks, connects relevant researchers with practitioners, and organises conferences and workshops.

We support the localization and implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals, including the development of Voluntary Local Reviews (VLRs) to trace progress at the local level. Sustainable development is only possible if it is just and equitable. Therefore, to make the greatest possible contribution to Agenda 2030, ICLD supports VLRs conducted with Community-based Participatory Research (CBPR), which assume specific methodologies to advance a bottow-up perspective and uplift the voices of marginalized groups. The reports - developed by researchers and local governments together - aim at simoultaneously strengthening local governments' capacity to engage citizens and implement Agenda2030, while innovating monitoring mechanisms to be more qualitative and capture the voice of the people they concern.

This report shows the measures Emboreet in Tanzania, a Maassai village engaged in a municipal partnership with Strängnäs, Sweden, has taken to ensure livelihoods, education and access to health, as well as roots remaining gaps in structural and technical challenges that remain. The process has been instructive to the village leadership about their way forward. But perhaps the most important result is that communities were asked, listened to, and empowered to participate in shaping their local reality.

My genuine opinion is, to fight poverty and reach the ambitious goals set out by Agenda 2030, change must be anchored at the local level by means of equity, participation, transparency, and accountability – and leave no one behind. I hope that this study can help Emboreet local government to improve their work as well as inspire others to explore participatory methods in research and policy-making.

Visby, Sweden

Johan Lilja, Secretary General, ICLD June 2023

About the Authors



Ms. Asia Majid is an Assistant Lecturer at the University of Dar es Salaam, Institute of Development Studies specializing in science and technology for development, energy, and environmental sciences. She holds a Master's degree in Oil and Natural Gas Engineering and a Bachelor's degree in Environmental Science and Laboratory Technology. Her areas of research interest include energy, environment, climate change, gender, as well as governance.

majid.asia@hotmail.com/igangula.asia@udsm.ac.tz



Dr. Gelas Rubakula, a lecturer at the University of Dar es Salaam, Institute of Development Studies, is a Public Sector Reform and Land Policy Analyst. Gelas Rubakula provides a qualitative perspective on new developments in public administration, governance, and public policymaking. His professional Public Administration and Land Resources Management background has expanded his current involvement in different research projects. Areas of research interests include Land Use Policy, Public Sector Reform, Governance, Globalization, and Democracy.

rubakula.gelas@udsm.ac.tz

Executive Summary

This report presents a concise overview of the key findings and highlights from the research project to create a Voluntary Local Review conducted in Emboreet village. It uses a community-based participatory approach to provide an overview of the village's progress, challenges, and aspirations in implementing the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

The report highlights that a majority of respondents in Emboreet village were aware of the existence of SDGs, with a notable emphasis on SDGs related to hunger (SDG 2), health and well-being (SDG 3), education (SDG 4), water and sanitation (SDG 6), infrastructure (SDG 9), and climate change (SDG 13) as these reflect the pressing challenges within their community. The community knew of the SDGs primarily through news reports, social media, local government, academia, and development partners.

The review identified a priority mismatch among stakeholders, with Simanjiro District council prioritizing SDGs 3, 4, and 10, while Emboreet village council prioritized SDGs 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, and 13. The community members' preferences closely align with those of the village council, with SDGs 2, 3, 4, 6, 9 and 13 being their primary concerns. This indicates the need for dialogue and collaboration to bridge the gap and ensure all aspects of sustainable development are addressed.

To ensure the principle of leaving no one behind, the Emboreet village council has implemented several measures. These include supporting incomechallenged and vulnerable individuals through the Poverty Reduction Fund, providing free vaccination for children against Polio, and allocating 10% of its income to empower youth, women, and people with disabilities through economic empowerment initiatives. However, the review revealed that marginalized and vulnerable groups, such as people with disabilities, the elderly, and youth, still receive limited attention and support.

Community members in Emboreet village actively participate in the development of their community, particularly in projects that require mobilization of community resources. While the village council has made efforts to include the community in planning and decision-making for development, it was found that not all development projects properly incorporate citizen participation. In some instances, community members are informed about ongoing initiatives or projects, but their ability to directly influence decisionmaking and implementation may be limited.

Efforts made towards SDG implementation in Emboreet village were notable, focusing on democratic and accountable government, sustainable provision of social services, social and economic development, and nurturing a safe and healthy environment. However, financial limitations, limited national government support, cultural barriers, and SDG data availability were identified as significant challenges in implementing and localizing the SDGs.

The report recognizes the importance of SDG monitoring and reporting in ensuring accountability and improving implementation. While the local government has not previously conducted voluntary local reviews and assessments, there was a general consensus among respondents that a voluntary review process would enhance implementation and accountability.

The findings highlight the importance of continued community engagement, improved resource allocation, strengthened institutional mechanisms, and enhanced data management for effective SDG implementation. Recommendations include promoting multistakeholder partnerships, fostering capacity-building initiatives, and fostering an enabling environment for sustainable development.

The insights from this Voluntary Local Review in Emboreet village provide valuable information and inspiration for policymakers, local governments, and stakeholders elsewhere in formulating strategies and interventions to accelerate progress towards the SDGs, notably by motivating deep citizen consultations and participation. The report underscores the significance of participatory approaches and collaboration in achieving sustainable development at the community level.

Introduction

In September 2015, the United Nations adopted 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) with 169 targets to address global concerns regarding social, environmental, and economic growth [1]. The integration of SDGs into policies and practices is crucial for achieving the 2030 Agenda, requiring the involvement of local governments in implementing the SDGs through a process of localization and working closely with stakeholders, including citizens, to promote inclusive sustainable development [2], [3].

Mirroring Voluntary National Reviews which Member States can submit to the UN to trace their progress toward the SDGs, Voluntary Local Reviews (VLRs) have gained prominence as a means to assess SDG implementation at the local level and the impact of localization policies on national implementation, with an increasing number of local and regional governments engaging in the assessment process [4]. Local and regional governments may use VLRs to communicate their stories and promote local priorities. VLRs enable the evaluation of local obstacles and priorities in achieving the SDGs at the subnational level, resulting in a more comprehensive narrative of national development [5]. Studies conducted in South America and Asia have affirmed the usefulness of VLRs in advancing progress of the SDGs at the grassroots level [6] [7].

Citizen- and community participation in SDG implementation has been recognized as valuable in achieving positive impacts on the goals and targets [5] [9]. However, challenges may arise in developing a concerted and agreeable implementation framework at the community level, including the setting of realistic targets [10] [11] [12]. Community participation in and through VLRs can help bridge the gap by incorporating social factors into the SDGs and enabling citizens to provide valuable information for policy changes [13] [14].

Several African countries such as Kisumu (Kenya) and Capetown (South Africa), have reported on the local challenges of SDG implementation at the grassroots level as due to weak multi-level government structures and limited institution capacity [15]. To overcome these challenges, a solid framework for multistakeholder involvement and coordination at all levels of governance is necessary [15] [16]. In Tanzania, the SDGs are being implemented within the framework of Tanzania Development Vision 2025, aiming to transform the nation into a middle-income and semiindustrialized country by 2025. Tanzania has adopted and prioritized SDGs 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9, and 17, as outlined in the Five Years Development Plan II (2016-2021) [17]. The Local Government Authority (LGA) system in Tanzania ensures the decentralization of essential services, enabling planning, monitoring, and implementation closer to the communities through local council revenues [18]. Emboreet Village Council has integrated the Tanzania Development Vision 2025 and the Five Years Development Plan II into its development plans, aligning with the prioritized SDGs set by the United Nations.

There is no predetermined format or structure of Voluntary Local Reviews. However, many VLRs are based on preexisting city data and quantitative indicators which presents a missed opportunity to capture qualitative data from communities and marginalized groups. This report is the VLR conducted in Emboreet village in the form of a community-based participatory study.

Objective of the VLR

The VLR in Emboreet village aimed to examine SDG awareness among different stakeholders in Emboreet village; identify SDG priorities between the village council and the community stakeholders; assess citizen participation and engagement in SDG implementation; highlight implementation challenges, and propose solutions to accelerate progress towards the SDGs. The review focused on selected goals as adopted by the Emboreet village from the Tanzania Vision 2025 and other community stakeholders, including;

- No poverty (SDG 1)
- Zero hunger (SDG2)
- Good health and well-being (SDG3)
- Quality education (SDG4)
- Gender equality (SDG5)

- Clean water and sanitation (SDG6)
- Affordable and clean energy (SDG7)
- Industry, innovation and infrastructure (SDG9)
- Reduced inequalities (SDG10)
- Sustainable cities and communities (SDG11)
- Climate action (SDG13)
- Peace, justice and strong institutions (SDG16), and
- Partnership for goals (SDG17)

In doing so, the VLR intended to contribute to a comprehensive understanding of the SDG landscape in Emboreet Village and provide recommendations for improving SDG implementation and engagement.

Context of Emboreet ward

Emboreet village is situated within the Emboreet ward, located in the Simanjiro district of the Manyara region in Tanzania. As per the 2022 Tanzania census, the estimated population of the Emboreet ward is 20,996 individuals. Among them, there are 49% men and 51% women, resulting in a sex ratio of 96% [4]. It can be estimated that Emboreet Village has a population of approximately 7,000 people. The predominant ethnic group in Emboreet village is the Maasai, with only a small representation of other ethnicities from different parts of Tanzania. The village comprises seven vitongoji (hamlets), namely Emboreet Madukani, Ingun'g, Maleleki, Laarkatial, Esilalei, Katikati, and Lenaitunyo."

Rwanda Burundi Emboreet Mombasa Tanzania Dar es Salaam Emboreet village possesses essential social infrastructure to cater to the needs of its citizens. The village is equipped with two primary schools, one secondary school, one vocational training institute, one civil society organization, three churches, one mosque, and a health center owned and operated by the Catholic Church. However, it is worth noting that access to basic amenities such as water and electricity is limited to one vitongoji (hamlet) in the village, Emboreet Madukani.



Figure 2. Emboreet secondary school

The primary economic activity in Emboreet village revolves around agriculture, encompassing both livestock keeping and farming. The village's residents engage in rearing cows, goats, sheep, and chickens, while cultivating crops such as maize, sunflower, and beans. In addition to agriculture, there are also various small-scale business activities present in the village, including shops, restaurants, and bars.



Figure 3. Cow grazing as one of the main economic activities at Emboreet village

Figure 1. A map showing the location of Emboreet village. Source: Google Maps

Methodology

Institutional mechanisms

To conduct VLR at Emboreet village, formal arrangements between the University of Dar es Salaam, Institute of Development Studies (IDS) researchers, local assistant researchers and the Simanjiro district council as well as the Emboreet village council were established. This partnership was important to ensure alignment with the local governments' priority and objectives, collaborate and work together, ensure integration of local knowledge, expertise and perspective on the VLR of the SDGs.

In addition, the VLR utilized the hybrid model of partnership and hub and spoke model to conduct the review [20]. The lead research coordinator who is an academic from the University of Dar es Salaam, the focal person for the coordination using hub and spoke model worked in close collaboration with the office of the Simanjiro district council, Civil Society Organizations (CSO) and Nonprofit Organizations (NGO's) so as to ensure consistent information sharing. Using the partnership model, the lead research investigator worked in collaboration with two research assistants from the Emboreet village community and the Emboreet village council chairman involving participation of Emboreet community members. This approach was necessary so as to ensure active participation of Emboreet community members in the VLR process so as to integrate their priorities towards sustainable development.

To facilitate communication sharing among the stakeholders that were involved, meetings, physical visits and telephone communication channels were utilized. The established partnership among stakeholders including Emboreet community members and the models adopted ensured effective collaborations, information and knowledge exchange, ensuring integration of the community priority into the VLR process.

Stakeholder mobilization – the communitybased participatory approach

The Emboreet village VLR adopted a community based participatory research approach (CBPR) to combine the research with an empowerment effect for the community. CBPR aims to engage the target group of a study in all phases of the research, to empower local voices and facilitate knowledge uptake. Stakeholder mobilization and engagement in this study aimed to promote participation and make sure that all perspectives and priorities were incorporated into the VLR process to ensure a thorough and inclusive evaluation of the village's progress toward the SDGs, and subsequent measures.

Simanjiro district council and Emboreet village council were engaged to gather information on SDGs priorities, budget allocation, and implementation in Emboreet village. Through in-depth interviews, using questionnaires (see Annex I and II), representatives from the councils and community members were interviewed to understand their perspective and gather relevant data. Furthermore, NGOs and CSOs located in Simanjiro district that specifically serve the Emboreet community and the ones located at Emboreet were contacted and interviewed on to identify their priority areas and evaluate their contribution to the SDGs' implementation. Engaging vulnerable groups such as women, children, young people, the elderly, and those with disabilities, was another key component of the VLR. Through surveys and focus group discussions, their views and perspectives were included in the review.

Data collection and processing

Within this framework, both qualitative and quantitative data was used to achieve a thorough understanding of the SDGs implementation in Emboreet village, as detailed below.

Document review

To improve subject understanding, a comprehensive review of the literature was carried out, including journals, articles, and reports on the localization of the SDGs and community involvement in SDG implementation.

Focus group discussions (FGDs)

The VLR involved two focus group discussions with representation from diverse stakeholders. Both groups consisted of women and people with disabilities as representatives of vulnerable groups, youth, community business people, Maasai traditional leaders, local government officers, civil servants (such as teachers and doctors), and religious leaders from different hamlets (Vitongoji). Each FGD comprised 12 people, with three being the main VLR researchers and the remaining nine representing different stakeholder groups.



Figure 4. FGD session in Emboreet village

Survey

A cluster sampling technique was applied, targeting 250 respondents from the seven vitongoji (hamlets) within Emboreet village. The review objectives were addressed through a software-based questionnaire tool with a mix of closed- and open-ended questions

Participatory video

Including participatory video aimed to enable community members to offer their opinions in a communicable way on the implementation of sustainable development in their community, raise awareness about their priority areas for SDGs, advocate for citizen participation, and contribute to social transformation. Participatory video is an approach where the target group of the research is part of creating a video to stimulate reflection, gather insights and own conclusions. In this case the village leadership was part of the creating team and the results validated with the featured individuals. The choice of participants for the video-making process was made with inclusivity as a primary consideration. It was carefully examined to include representation from a range of stakeholder groups, including women, youth, local traditional leaders, business owners, and village council officials. Due to the videos' wide representation, the viewpoints, needs, and difficulties of the community were fully represented. Video data were analyzed through video editing to ensure stakeholder participants' voices and messages were accurately represented. The video process not only shed light on the achievements and progress made towards the SDGs but also identified areas that required additional attention and resources.

Data analysis

SPSS (Statistical Package for the Social Sciences) software was used to process quantitative data from the surveys in order to compute descriptive statistics, inferential statistics, and find correlations between variables. The analysis aimed to summarize the responses, identify patterns, relationships, trends within the data.

Qualitative data, including insights from focus group discussions and key informant interviews were analyzed using thematic analysis. Carefully reviewing the transcripts and recorded responses provided recurring themes and codes. This approach provided priorities and viewpoints of various stakeholders in connection to the SDGs to complement, nuance and enrich the quantitative data.

Indicator selection

The specific targets and indicators for each prioritized Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) were chosen from the SDG catalog according to local relevance. However, certain SDG indicators were inaccessible due to unavailable data. In some cases, specific targets were substituted. The lack of available data significantly constrains the assessment of the SDGs in this VLR and in accelerating their progress.

SDG Prioritization and implementation

This chapter discusses the environment for implementation of the SDGs within Emboreet village to create ownership of the SDGs, along with relevant practices, norms and cultural factors that shape both implementation and the sense of importance and urgency among different stakeholders.

Policy and enabling environment

Local governments in Tanzania operate under the Ministry for Regional Administration and Local Government (MRALG), which works with the Prime Minister's Office to formulate broad national policies and to monitor local authorities to ensure that the policies are integrated into locally developed programs. District councils coordinate the activities of the township authorities and village councils. Emboreet village follows a rural system of governance whereby the activities of the village council are coordinated by the district council (in this case Simanjiro) and the village is accountable to the district council for all the revenues received for day-to-day administration. The village council is responsible for formulating plans for their area, in most cases with district approval. Village councils are elected by the village assembly and has three standing committees: finance and planning; social services; and defense and security and two statutory committees of HIV/AIDS and council ethics committees. The role of the committees is to develop policy, set budgets and oversee the work of specific departments [5].

According to the UN [22], localization is the process of defining, implementing and monitoring strategies at the local level for achieving global, national, and sub-national sustainable development goals and targets. The Emboreet Village council has incorporated the Tanzania Development Vision 2025 (2015 -2025) and the National Five-Year Development Plan 2021/22 – 2025/26 (FYDP) to reach the UN Agenda 2030 and the 2063 African agenda. The seven vitongoji (hamlets) in Emboreet each comprise an elected chairperson who appoints a secretary and three further members, all of whom serve on an advisory committee. All these committees provide a grassroots link to the ward structure, and enable participation of local people in local development.

Emboreet village council ensures that everyone is involved in the implementation of SDGs through community meetings. The first meeting starts at the vitongoji (hamlet) level were community members gather and identify challenges that face them and decide on the development challenge that need action to be taken. Priorities for local service delivery and development projects are discussed by the committees, before being forwarded to the ward development committee (WDC) by the village council. WDC members includes the elected ward councilor as chairperson, the ward executive officer (WEO), a salaried official with no voting rights, women councilors, all village chairpersons within the ward and all village executive officers (VEOs). According to the rural system of governance of Tanzania, the WDC is responsible for coordinating the development plans and social service plans, supervising project implementation and service delivery activities, and serving as a liaison between sub-ward projects and higher-tier local government development plans [5].

In addition to the identified challenge the village council works with CSOs and NGOs that are willing to help solve the challenge. For projects that cannot be solved by the village council and the community they are addressed to the district council and await a solution from them. Thus, at Emboreet village, communities identify their priorities and use available local resources to overcome their challenges. Communities thereby become the main actors for their own development and the Government becomes the enabler where the community cannot perform.



Source: [6]

Priorities of the local government and stakeholder communities

This section identifies and analyses the SGDs prioritized by the Simanjiro district council, Emboreet village council, CSOs, NGOs and the Emboreet community members and how they align with the needs and aspiration of the village. While there is general alignment of the priorities among stakeholders, there are some notable differences. Findings from the in-depth interviews with key stakeholders showed that Simanjiro district council prioritizes three Sustainable Development Goals: SDG 3, SDG 4 and SDG 10. On the contrary Emboreet village council focuses on SDGs 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 13. Furthermore, the findings showed that, CSOs prioritized all the SDGs with exceptions of SDG 8, 11, 12, 14 and 15. The priority mismatch

among Simanjiro district council, Emboreet village council and CSOs shows difference in perspectives and interests of the stakeholders. It shows the need for engagement in dialogue and collaboration to bridge the gap and ensure important aspects of sustainable development are clearly addressed.

Additionally, findings from the survey showed that Emboreet community members mainly care about SDGs 2, 3, 4, 6, and 13 as seen on figure 6 below. This indicates a stronger emphasis on addressing basic needs and immediate concerns in relation to food security, health care, education, availability of water, infrastructure and climate change mitigation at the local level.



Figure 6. SDGS priorities at Emboreet village by community members

Integration of key principles of development and democracy

This section focuses on the integration of key principles, as established in the literature and practice of democracy and sustainable development, into the prioritization and implementation of SDGs at Emboreet village, to ensure a comprehensive and inclusive approach to development. This also makes up the analytical lens for this review. Four key dimensions are addressed: leave no one behind; gender equality, participation and accountability.

Leaving No One Behind

As a key principle in Agenda 2030, this highlights the necessity of ensuring that development benefits all members of the community, with particular attention to those who are marginalized, vulnerable, or disadvantaged. The VLR assessed the extent to which the prioritized SDGs address the specific needs and concerns of various groups within the Emboreet village, including women, children, and people with disabilities, youth and the elderly.

To comply with this equity dimension and ensure no one is left behind, the Emboreet village council has implemented several measures. It allocates 10% of its revenues to empower youth, women and people with disability through economic empowerment initiatives. For instance, related to SDG 1 (no poverty), the council has a poverty reduction fund through the Tanzania Social Action Funds (TASAF). This fund supports income-challenged and vulnerable individuals identified by the village council in collaboration with the village local leaders. In addition, the village

WORKING PAPER NO 21

council is implementing the free secondary education policy set by the government of Tanzania in 2015 thus enabling children from poor families' access to education hence accelerating attainment of SDG 4. The village council also provides free vaccination for children against Polio, which relates to SDG 3 on good health and well-being.

Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) also play a crucial role to the principle of leaving no one behind in the village. For instance, the Tanzania Conservation and Community Empowerment Initiative (TACCEI) in Simanjiro has implemented a Maasai Women Empowerment and Climate Change Adaptation Project (MWECCAP), which aims to alleviate poverty among Maasai women. Specifically targeting Maasai women to help lift them from poverty.

However, the review revealed that, despite the 10% from the local government allocated to marginalized and vulnerable groups in the village, people with disability, elderly and youth receive limited attention and support. This concern was raised during the Focus Group discussion (FGD) with one of the participants highlighting that "It seems that the only group which has been given more attention and empowerment are women, while people with disability, the elderly and the youth are neglected".

Gender Equality

Gender equality is a fundamental principle that advocates for equal rights, opportunities, and involvement of both men and women in development. However, Emboreet village is a patriarchal Maasaioriented society where men predominantly make the decisions, leaving Maasai women devoid of decisionmaking rights and land inheritance. Consequently, the development contributions of Maasai women, including those described in this report, largely hinge on decisions made by men. More gender equality initiatives are needed from both the local government and the CSOs to strengthen women's rights.

In collaboration with the Ministry of Community Development, Gender and Special Groups, Emboreet

village council ensures gender mainstreaming in the implementation of the programs, which includes women, girls and boys' participation in planning, implementation and monitoring activities at the community levels. In Emboreet village, both men and women participate in community meetings and resource mobilization hence contributing to SDG implementation of their village. However, gender gaps persist in the fields of education and employment, as highlighted in figure 7. Most women in the village lack formal education and are not actively engaged in economic activities. This highlights the need for gender mainstreaming in education and the employment sector.

Recognizing the need for economic empowerment, the Emboreet village council has taken steps to coordinate microfinance groups, primarily consisting of women. These groups engage in economic activities such as crafting cultural ornaments and participating in agricultural activities to uplift them from poverty and contribute to the village's economic development. Economic empowerment initiatives are supported by both the Emboreet village council and Civil Society Organizations (CSO's).

Another crucial aspect of promoting gender equality in the village is raising awareness. The Emboreet village council and CSOs have developed programs focused on advocacy for gender equality within the community, to remove gender-based obstacles and fostering a community where men and women are able to thrive on the same basis.



Figure 7. Men and Women engagement in economic activities

Participation

The participation principle emphasizes the active involvement of all stakeholders including community members in the design, implementation and monitoring of development initiative. It is an essential component of sustainable development as it ensures that community priorities and needs are considered and that development efforts are more inclusive and successful.

The survey conducted in this study showed that community members participate actively on the development of their community, particularly in projects that require community mobilization of resources. 57.3% of the interviewed respondents actively engage in planning and discussing development issues in their community through participation in community meetings (see fig. 8). Additionally, 32.5 % of the respondents contribute to the achievement of the SDGs through resource mobilization, wherein they contribute money or physical labor to address community needs.

While the village council has made efforts to include the community in planning and decision-making for development, not all development projects properly incorporate citizen participation. In some instances, community members are informed about ongoing initiatives or projects such as water supply and road construction, but their ability to directly influence decision making and implementation may be limited. Only 8% actively participate in needs assessment for SDG implementation. Furthermore, figure 9 highlights that 56% of the interviewed respondents were not aware of the development initiatives done by the local government in their village.

A significant portion of respondents, 65.3%, are not aware of the collaboration and partnership between the Emboreet village council and other development stakeholders such as CSOs (see fig. 10). Only 25.6% of the respondents are aware of such collaborations and partnerships. This disparity highlights the need to enhance communication about the collaborative efforts of the village council and other stakeholders in driving development in Emboreet village. Wider awareness will lead to empowering the community demand accountable governance, greater to participation, enhanced resource mobilization, and progress in Emboreet village.







Figure 9. Community awareness on existence of community-led initiatives and projects at Emboreet village



Figure 10. Community awareness on local government collaboration and partnership with other development stakeholders

Accountability

Accountability is a key component in the SDG prioritization process as it requires and reproduces transparency, responsibility, and effective governance. To guarantee that actions are carried out to achieve the desired results, it entails the development of systems for reporting and feedback, as well as mechanisms for monitoring and evaluating progress. In Emboreet village, several mechanisms have been put in place to promote accountability in the SDG prioritization and implementation process.

Emboreet village has set up a framework for monitoring and evaluating the progress of SDG implementation. This framework and reporting mechanisms mainly uses target adjustment mechanisms, analysis of report and periodic reporting to monitor and evaluate each prioritized goal. Periodic reporting of at least once every six months are done and reports are shared with relevant stakeholders including community members through meetings, government agencies and development partners. These reports offer updates on achievement and challenges of the SDGs being implemented.

Although Emboreet village council and CSOs share periodic SDG implementation reports with the community, awareness of these reports appears relatively low. Figure 12 illustrates that a three quarters of the interviewed respondents did not know and were not aware of the reports shared while only 25 % know this. To ensure access to information that is necessary for the community to effectively demand accountability, there is a need to improve community awareness on the reports. The village council could leverage the existing communication channels such as community meetings, CSOs and through community leaders.

In addition, only CSOs use indicator changes to monitor and evaluate their SDG implementation process in the village as seen on figure 11. Indicators provide specific and measurable data that can help track progress more effectively. This shows the need to strengthen the use of indicators in monitoring and evaluation also by the local government.



Figure 11. Monitoring, evaluation and reporting mechanisms of SDG implementation in Emboreet village



Figure 12. Community awareness of SDG reporting implementation at Emboreet village

Vision

The village's vision focuses on several key SDGs, including Goal 2: Zero hunger, to address the issue of food security in the village, Goal 3: Good Health and Well-Being focuses on the need for improved health facilities. Goal 4: Quality education by ensuring equal access to education and necessary infrastructure needed, Goal 6: Clean water and sanitation by ensuring water access to all vitongoji (hamlets) in Emboreet and Goal 13: Climate action by planting trees and practicing climate smart agriculture. These goals were seen as critical to addressing the pressing challenges facing Emboreet village community and fostering long-term development. Further it highlights that both the local government, CSOs and the community members see the need for localization of SDGs so as to achieve the prioritized SDGs and contribute to the village vision.

Progress on goals and targets

This section assesses the efforts made by the local government and stakeholder communities in implementing the prioritized SDGs in Emboreet village: initiatives that are in line with the global Agenda 2030 and African Vision 2063 development agenda, while striving to meet the unique needs and concerns of the community. The Simanjiro district council, Emboreet village council and CSOs have taken several initiatives and efforts to implement the prioritized Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), in line with their differing priorities among the SDGs¹. On a general level, one of the key initiatives undertaken by these stakeholders is the allocation of yearly budgets dedicated to implementing the prioritized SDGs in Emboreet village, as illustrated in Table 1. Among the sectors that obtained more funding in year 2023 education stands out, which is in line with it being a major challenge for Emboreet village.

Table 1. Total annual budget of LGA and CSOs on prioritized SDGs in Emboreet
village

Total annual budget (USD)	2019/20	2021/22	2022/23
Simanjiro Village Council		11277122.94	11988635.08
Emboreet Ward Council	74682	103725	124470
NAFGEM	244297.23	250204.27	589006.65
ECLAT	497880	497880	497880
SELA	4771.35	5186.25	5601.15
TACCEI			12447

SDG 1: End poverty in all its forms everywhere



A63 Goal 1: A high standard of living, quality of life and well-being for all citizens

Target 1 a: Implement programs and policies to end poverty in all its dimensions

To implement SDG 1(No poverty) which aims to eradicate poverty in all its forms and dimensions, in the year 2022, Emboreet ward allocated a budget of 16,596.00 US dollars (USD) from the Poverty Reduction Fund project to address poverty within the community. Additionally, in 2023, a Beekeeping project is being implemented with funding from Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) amounting to 8,298 USD. The Tanzania Conservation and Community Empowerment Initiative (TACCEI) is also involved through their project called Maasai Women Empowerment and Climate Change Adaptation Project (MWECCAP), which aims to alleviate poverty among Maasai women. The Eclat Foundation has a poverty alleviation program specifically targeting Emboreet village, and the NAFGEM CSO in Simanjiro has implemented various projects to eradicate poverty in the community. These projects include a Soap Making project in 2017, a Bracelet Making project in 2019, and the provision of a corn grinding machine in 2020 to support a group of women in their struggle against poverty.

The data on engagement of community members in activities aimed at poverty eradication, as seen in figure 13, offers important perspectives on how much the local community actively participates in economic efforts to raise their standard of living and fight poverty on the individual level. 48.7% of the interviewed respondents are self-employed, engaging in livestock keeping, farming and small-scale entrepreneurship as their primary source of income. These community

1 As previously mentioned, Simanjiro district council prioritizes SDG 3, SDG 4 and SDG 10, while Emboreet village focuses on a broader range of SDGs including 1,2,3,4,5,6,7 and 13. The CSOs in the village have shown a commitment to addressing all the SDGs, except for SDGs 8, 11, 12, 14 and 15.

members use their agricultural resources and abilities to make a living and support their families. Encouraging agriculture and livestock-related activities are thereby important strategies for alleviating poverty in the village.

34.7% of the respondents were not employed, highlighting the challenges faced by a significant portion of the community in accessing sustainable livelihood opportunities. This emphasizes the need for targeted interventions to create employment opportunities to empower the unemployed population and uplift them from poverty. For example, women in the community have formed groups with the support of the Local Government Authority (LGA), CSOs, and NGOs, engaging in various economic activities to improve their financial well-being.

Despite these efforts, the review revealed that a significant portion of the population in Emboreet still lives in extreme poverty. Social, cultural, and financial constraints have been identified as contributing factors to the persistence of poverty within the community. Additionally, poverty eradication in Emboreet is considered an individual responsibility by the community rather than the role of the government. This is why, based on the review findings, SDG1 (No Poverty) was not among the prioritized goal within the Emboreet community. This implies that further initiatives and resources are needed to address the underlying social, cultural, and economic barriers that contribute to the community's persistent poverty.



Figure 13. Level of engagement in economic activities of community members in Emboreet village

SDG 2: End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture



A63 Goal 3: Healthy and well-nourished citizens

Indicator 2.4.1 Proportion of agricultural area under productive and sustainable agriculture

In collaboration with the Ministry of Agriculture, the Local Government Authority (LGA) plays a crucial role in addressing SDG 2 (Zero Hunger) in Emboreet village. The LGA's efforts focus on providing microfinancing and extension services to small agricultural holdings, aiming to increase productivity among subsistence farmers. These interventions are essential in promoting food security and reducing hunger in the community.

In 2023, Emboreet village council has implemented two programs to address hunger, with funding provided by the LGA. The first program is the Food Provision Program, which allocates 4,149 USD to ensure access to food for vulnerable community members. The second program is the Pesticide Provision Program, allocating 1,908.54 USD to support farmers in protecting their crops and increasing agricultural productivity. NAFGEM CSO also contributes to SDG 2 through various programs, including farming, animal rearing, and business empowerment initiatives. These programs aim to enhance food production, improve livelihoods, and reduce hunger in the community. TACCEI foundation has implemented community garden projects in 2023, specifically targeting SDG 2. These projects aim to ensure food security by promoting sustainable agricultural practices and empowering community members to cultivate their own food. Furthermore, as highlighted in figure 13 above, most community members actively engage in farming activities and animal rearing, which are vital for food production and self-sufficiency. These initiatives and community participation in agriculture show the effort being made by everyone to end hunger and achieve SDG 2. However, the review data indicates that further efforts are needed to ensure access to food and enhance agricultural productivity for all community members.



Figure 14. Livestock keeping contributes to SDG 2 in Emboreet village



SDG 3: Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages

A63 Goal 3: Healthy and well-nourished citizens

Target 3.7: By 2030, ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health-care services, including for family planning, information and education, and the integration of reproductive health into national strategies and programmes;

Indicator: 3.8.1 Coverage of essential health services; **3.b.1** Proportion of the target population covered by all vaccines included in their national programme.

Health and well-being is a crucial goal in Emboreet village. Efforts are being made by various stakeholders to improve healthcare services and ensure the well-being of the community members. In 2023, the Simanjiro district council allocated a budget of 400,378.50 USD from its own revenue, dedicated to the construction of health centers, facilities, healthcare worker housing, and medication. This investment aims to enhance healthcare infrastructure and services within the village. In 2021, the village council also utilized their own resources to construct residents for healthcare workers, allocating

14,521.50 USD for this purpose. Furthermore, a hospital ward was constructed with a budget of 22,819.50 USD, provided by the Local Government Authority (LGA). These initiatives demonstrate the commitment to improving health facilities and services in Emboreet village.

In 2023, the Tanzania Conservation and Community Empowerment Initiative (TACCEI) launched a program to improve nutrition among Emboreet children. This program has a budget of 10,000 USD and aims to address malnutrition and promote healthier dietary practices among children. Additionally, the Eclat Development Foundation is implementing a family education program to support the Emboreet community in family planning. This initiative focuses on educating community members about family planning methods and reproductive health, contributing to the overall wellbeing of families within the village. Furthermore, the NAFGEM organization funds free health services for elders and children, ensuring that these vulnerable groups have access to essential healthcare services.

In terms of access to healthcare, Emboreet village currently has only one healthcare center, which is owned by the Catholic Church. This indicates that the LGA has given relatively little attention to this goal, despite it being a priority for the community. Further attention and development in the healthcare sector is thus needed to ensure that adequate healthcare services are readily accessible to all members of the Emboreet community. The reliance on a single healthcare center, rather than a broader network of care facilities, can lead to disparities in health outcomes and could particularly affect vulnerable groups such as the elderly and children. It is therefore also a question of equity.

In addition, the review identified a tendency among the Emboreet community members, particularly the Maasai population, to avoid hospital attendance. This sentiment was shared by the hospital director, who explained that "Maasai people tend to avoid hospitals until their health condition becomes critical, preferring traditional remedies instead". The preference for traditional remedies, as observed among the Maasai, may also reflect a lack of trust or familiarity with modern healthcare practices. This may reflect a potential gap in understanding the benefits of modern healthcare practices. To address this, concerted efforts are required to bridge the gap in perception and encourage community members, especially the Maasai, to seek health checks and medical treatment when needed.



Figure 15. Emboreet village health center



SDG 4: Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all

A63 Goal 2: Well educated citizens and skills revolution underpinned by science, technology and innovation

A63 Goal 18: Engaged and empowered youth and children

SDG Indicator 4.1.2: Completion rate (primary education, lower secondary education, upper secondary education)

Significant efforts are being made to improve educational facilities and promote access to education for all community members in Emboreet village, and several initiatives demonstrate a commitment to expanding educational facilities within the community. The Simanjiro district council has allocated a budget of 63,910.99 USD in 2023 for the construction of a secondary school and teachers' housing. This investment aims to provide educational opportunities for students at the secondary level and improve the working and living conditions for teachers. In the period of 2020-2023, the Emboreet village council has also undertaken construction projects to enhance the educational infrastructure. They have constructed secondary school classrooms worth 20,745 USD and school teacher houses worth 33,192 USD, utilizing the budget provided by the Local Government Authority (LGA).

Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) play a crucial role in implementing SDG 4 in Simanjiro district and Emboreet village. For instance, the NAFGEM organization has programs that support education for girls from poor families, including the construction, repair, and renovation of school classrooms. The Eclat Development Foundation also contributes to SDG 4 by aiming to construct at least six schools annually. So far, they have successfully built a primary school, secondary school, and vocational training school, providing increased educational opportunities for community members.

The review also revealed that community members actively contribute to the development of SDG 4 as seen on figure 9 above on community engagement in SDG implementation at Emboreet village. They have built a kindergarten through their own contributions, showcasing their commitment to early childhood education. However, despite the efforts of the LGA, CSOs, and the community, using indicator 4.1.2 of Quality Education on completion rate, it was found that 38.7% of the interviewed respondents did not attend formal education, 34.2% have only attained primary education, 22.6% have attained secondary education and with only a few individuals, 2.5% having had access to tertiary education. This highlights the need for continued focus on improving access to quality education and promoting educational attainment at all levels within the community, especially considering the percentage of individuals with limited or no formal education.



Figure 16. Level of community education among respondents of Emboreet village



SDG 5: Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls

A63 Goal 18: Engaged and empowered youth and children.

Target 5.1: End all forms of discrimination against all women and girls everywhere

Various initiatives have been undertaken in Emboreet village to promote gender equality and empower women and girls. In 2022, the Emboreet village council allocated a budget of 2,074.50 USD to a non-governmental organization (NGO) to raise awareness about gender equality within the community. The Eclat Development Foundation and the NAFGEM organizations also contribute to the implementation of SDG 5 by conducting empowerment programs and providing education on gender equality. These efforts aim to challenge gender norms, empower women and girls, and promote equal opportunities.

The Simanjiro Citizen Empowerment and Legal Assistance Organization (SELA) has an ongoing project (2018-2025) to provide legal aid and education specifically for women in Simanjiro, including in Emboreet. This project is valued at 19,915.20 USD and seeks to enhance the rights and legal knowledge of women, enabling them to participate fully in society. In addition, the Sport

Impact and Discipleship Development Organization (SPIDD) organizes female football games with the support of development partners. In 2013, a budget of 82.98 USD was allocated for this activity, promoting sports engagement and empowering girls through participation in sports.

Furthermore, the data shows that there are gender differences in educational achievement, with fewer women moving on to higher levels of education. This was further emphasized by one of the mothers who said:

"In Emboreet village, educating a girl is met with ridicule. Even my father educated all my brothers except me. When I enrolled my daughter in school, I faced mockery. Yet, I was determined to provide her with an education, unlike mine. She and another girl are the village's only two female university students, set to graduate this year."

This emphasizes the requirement to remove obstacles standing in the way of women and girls pursuing education and realizing their full potential aligning with Target 5.1 on gender equality as well as the previous goal on quality education.

Moreover, the data emphasizes the presence of strong cultural values and a patriarchal nature within the community. Due to the nature of the village culture, the survey has a low number of female respondents, with a disproportionate number of educated women. As emphasized in the quote above, however, most women lack access to formal education. This factor makes the proportion of female respondents with access to education, which is higher than that of men, misleading. Together, the findings show that access to education is difficult for both sexes, with a significant percentage of the population lacking a formal education.

These cultural norms perpetuate gender inequality and restrict opportunities for women and girls. In order to attain gender equality within the Emboreet community, these findings emphasize the necessity for ongoing efforts to question gender norms, expand educational opportunities for women and girls, and overcome cultural barriers.



Figure 17. Cultural norms affecting survey participation generates a misleading graph on sex distribution in education in Emboreet village



SDG 6: Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all

A63 Goal 6: Blue/ocean economy for accelerated economic growth

Indicators 6.1.1 Proportion of population using safely managed drinking water service; **6.2.1** Proportion of population using safely managed sanitation services

In 2022, the Emboreet village council allocated a budget of 145,215 USD from the Local Government Authority (LGA) to construct a water supply tank. However, it was found that the water tank only supplies water to one hamlet (kitongoji) in Emboreet which is Emboreet Madukani, while the remaining six hamlets (vitongoji) still lack access to clean water. To address this issue, in 2023, the village council drilled two water wells using funds from an NGO, amounting to 18,670.50 USD. The Eclat Development Foundation has also contributed to SDG 6 by drilling water wells for the Emboreet community in other hamlets.

Despite efforts made, the majority of people in Emboreet village still lack access to water, making the achievement of SDG 6 a prioritized goal for the community. Women and children suffer the most, being forced to walk long distances and spend a significant portion of their day to fetch water. This severely reduces their opportunities to engage in economic activities and therefore limits their potential to personal and communal growth and development. Children's lives are disrupted as they dedicate considerable time to fetching water instead of actively participating in school activities, hampering their education and overall development. Additionally, it was found that a significant number of community members do not have access to proper sanitation practices, as many lack toilets. This highlights the need for further investment and strategies to improve water access, ensure sustainable water management, and promote proper sanitation practices within the community.



Figure 18. Water supply tanks and a borehole in Emboreet village

SDG 7: Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all



A63 Goal: Environmentally sustainable and climate resilient economies and communities

Indicators 7.1.1: Proportion of population with access to electricity; **7.1.2** Proportion of population with primary reliance on clean fuels and technology

Achieving the objective of affordable, reliable, sustainable, and modern energy for all is essential for increasing livelihoods, encouraging economic development, and enhancing the general wellbeing of the community in Emboreet village. To address the challenges associated

WORKING PAPER NO 21

with SDG 7, the Emboreet village council has undertaken two projects funded by an NGO. In 2021, a training program was implemented to educate the community on the benefits of using less fuel-consuming cookers and promoting clean cooking practices.

In 2022, Emboreet village council conducted the Rural Energy Electricity program, with funding provided by the Local Government Authority (LGA). While these efforts have made a positive impact, it is important to note that only one hamlet (kitongoji), Emboreet Madukani, currently has access to electricity from Tanzania Electricity Supply Company (TANESCO). The remaining hamlets vitongoji still lack access to electricity, resulting in limited opportunities for economic growth and social development. One of the interviewed respondents showed her dissatisfaction with the efforts done by the local government to ensure supply of electricity within the village: "I do not understand why we do not have access to electricity as Emboreet Madukani hamlet although we are near to each other".

Solar power could be an alternative sustainable and renewable energy source, which the majority of the community members do not yet have access to. It is worth noting that, apart from the LGA, no Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) have been involved in implementing initiatives related to SDG 7 in Emboreet village. Engaging CSOs with expertise in off-grid solar power systems and energy-related initiatives could make an important difference in increasing the community's access to clean and sustainable energy.



SDG 9: Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation SDG 9 aims to build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization, and foster innovation. These objectives are crucial for driving economic growth, enhancing productivity, and creating opportunities for the community in Emboreet village. From the review it was found out that SDG 9 was among the most prioritized SDG by the Emboreet community members, as seen earlier in figure 6. However, it was observed that neither the Simanjiro district council nor the Emboreet village council had allocated budgets or undertaken specific activities to achieve this goal. This lack of prioritization by the local authorities suggests a missed opportunity to address the infrastructure needs of the community.

Moreover, the review revealed that none of the interviewed CSOs were actively engaged in implementing initiatives related to SDG 9 in Emboreet village. This indicates a gap in collaboration between CSOs and the community in pursuing sustainable and inclusive infrastructure development.

One notable challenge identified during the review is the poor state of roads in almost all the hamlets (vitogoji) of Emboreet. Poor infrastructure hampers the ability of children to attend school and poses difficulties for patients seeking medical care, especially during the rainy season, as narrated by one interviewee: "When it rains, it is difficult for children to go to school and even for patients to go to the hospital". The absence of specific efforts to improve infrastructure exacerbates these issues and hinders progress towards achieving SDG 9, while demonstrating the linkages with other SDGs. More attention to infrastructure development is crucial to address these challenges and promote sustainable development holistically.

A63 Goal 4: Transformed economies

Indicator 9.1.1 Proportion of the rural population who live within 2 km of an all-season road



Figure 19. One of the main roads in Emboreet village



SDG 10: Reduce inequality within and among countries

A63 Goal 20: Africa takes full responsibility for financing her development Goal

Target 10.2: By 2030, empower and promote the social, economic and political inclusion of all, irrespective of age, sex, disability, race, ethnicity, origin, religion or economic or other status

Target 10.3: Ensure equal opportunity and reduce inequalities of outcome, including by eliminating discriminatory laws, policies and practices and promoting appropriate legislation, policies and action in this regard

SDG 10 focuses on reducing inequality, emphasizing inclusivity and addressing disparities. In order to foster a more equitable society, there is a clear need for concerted efforts aimed at tackling income disparities, countering social exclusion, and enhancing access to essential services. However, in relation to Emboreet, the review highlights that only the Simanjiro District council and Simanjiro Citizen Empowerment and Legal Assistance Organization (SELA) have proactively allocated budget to and prioritized SDG 10. This may reflect a missed opportunity to comprehensively address inequality within Emboreet village.

In the year 2023, the Simanjiro District Council has allocated a budget of 43,368.29 USD from its own revenue sources to implement a diverse array of programs geared towards addressing inequalities within the district. A notable measure, intertwining SDG 10 and 5, involves providing loans to women in the village, effectively targeting income disparities. Furthermore, the SELA foundation administers a Legal Aid Program that specifically benefits women within the Simanjiro district, including Emboreet village. This program provides women with essential legal advice and assistance. A multifaceted approach contributes to addressing disparities on various levels, fostering greater equity and inclusivity within the community.

SDG 11: Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable



A63 Goal 1: A high standard of living, quality of life and well-being for all citizens

Target 11.c: Support least developed countries, including through financial and technical assistance, in building sustainable and resilient buildings utilizing local materials

The review conducted in Emboreet village revealed that while the Simanjiro District Council, Emboreet Village Council, and Civil Society Organizations have taken steps to allocate budgets and prioritize certain SDGs, SDG 11 on safe, resilient, and sustainable communities was notably absent from these efforts. The SDG 11 was also not identified as a prioritized goal among the community members of Emboreet. This lack of prioritization and dedicated efforts towards SDG 11 could be attributed to the fact that Tanzania, as observed, does not emphasize this particular goal within its national development strategies.

Despite its absence from the local priorities, the inclusion of SDG 11 in the report is driven by the broader context of sustainable development: while not an immediate focal point, the recognition of SDG 11's significance at the national and international levels prompts its intensified consideration. By thus advocating exploration of the challenges and potential opportunities aligned with SDG 11, the report seeks to underline the importance of addressing inclusive and sustainable communities, even in cases where they might not be immediately apparent. This approach contributes to a more comprehensive understanding of the village's development landscape. Therefore, while SDG 11 may not emerge as a local priority, it is included here by way of conclusion that the local and regional and community priorities are even better understood with a view to SDG 11. As such, it better integrated the broader sustainable development agenda and the potential benefits of integrating its principles within the village's long-term growth and welfare.



SDG 13: Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts

A63 Goal 7: Environmentally sustainable and climate resilient economies and communities.

Target 13.2: Integrate climate change measures into national policies, strategies, and planning

Climate change emerges as a major concern for both the Emboreet Village Council and the community members, as seen in Figure 6 earlier. An ongoing drought, attributed to the effects of climate change, has resulted in dry lands and a lack of rainfall, which significantly impacts agricultural activities and obstructs the attainment of SDG 2 (Zero Hunger). Long dry periods and a lack of rainfall have decreased soil moisture levels, making it difficult for crops to grow and develop normally. The insufficient water supply has led to stunted growth, lower production, and in some cases, crop failure. Moreover, the scarcity of water has had a significant impact on livestock rearing, which is an essential source of livelihood and sustenance for many households in Emboreet. To address this challenge, the Emboreet Village Council has implemented projects and programs.

In 2022, with funding from the Local Government Authority (LGA), the village council conducted a Climate Change Awareness campaign among the Emboreet community members. This initiative aimed to raise awareness about the impacts of climate change and promote sustainable practices. Furthermore, in 2023, a budget of 5,808.60 USD has been allocated for the initiation of a Tree Planting Project. The community members are actively engaged in this project, collaborating with the village council to contribute to reforestation efforts and mitigate the effects of climate change.

Among the 10 Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) interviewed, only one organization, TACCEI, addresses SDG 13. In 2017, TACCEI conducted a climate change awareness program for pastoral communities, receiving 1,000,000 USD funding from the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID). Additionally, in 2023, under the Maasai Women Empowerment and Climate Change Adaptation Project (MWECCAP), TACCEI aims to promote Climate Smart Agriculture at Emboreet village, with 1,000 USD funding from the Family Empowerment Ministries (FEMI). This project aims to promote Climate Smart Agriculture practices at Emboreet village, providing training, resources, and support to empower local women and enhance their resilience in the face of climate change impacts.

The community displays high awareness of the far-reaching consequences of climate change, and demonstrate willingness to engage in collaborative efforts with the local government and CSOs to addressing and overcoming the challenges posed by climate change. The initiatives by the Emboreet Village Council, TACCEI and the potential for community mobilisation demonstrate their commitment, but continued efforts are needed to build resilience and mitigate the effects of climate change on the community, particularly as the consequences of climate change felt in Emboreet village were not caused there.



SDG 16: Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels

A63 Goal 11: Democratic values, practices, universal principles of human rights, justice and the rule of law entrenched; Goal-12: Capable institutions and transformative leadership in place; Goal-13: Peace, security and stability is preserved

Target 16.7: Ensure responsive, inclusive, participatory and representative decision-making at all levels

SDG 16, which aims to promote peaceful and inclusive societies, provide access to justice, and build effective institutions, is an essential goal for sustainable development. The significance of this goal extends beyond its individual components, as it fundamentally supports the overall stability, equity, and progress of a society. By addressing violence, upholding the rule of law, ensuring access to justice, and establishing robust institutions, SDG 16 lays the groundwork for advancements in various other development pursuits. However, based on the review conducted, it was found that SDG 16 is not prioritized by the Simanjiro District Council, Emboreet Village Council, and the community members of Emboreet. This lack of prioritization reflects an overlooked opportunity to improve critical components of the village's justice, inclusion, and effective governance. There may be difficulties in ensuring access to justice for all people, encouraging accountability, and maintaining an inclusive and peaceful society if SDG 16 is not prioritized. Among the Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) involved in the review, only one organization, SELA, has taken action to promote justice within Emboreet Village through its Legal Aid program. This program is a positive step towards addressing the gaps in access to justice and promoting legal empowerment among community members, but not sufficient.

SDG 17: Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the Global Partnership for Sustainable Development



A63 Goal 19: Africa as a major partner in global affairs and peaceful co-existence

Indicator 17.3.1 Additional financial resources mobilized for developing countries from multiple sources

Emboreet village council collaborates with Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs). However, there are no specific budgets, projects, or initiatives set for SDG 17, which focuses on implementing development initiatives through partnerships. The lack of specific funding for SDG 17 demonstrates an overlooked chance in Emboreet village to improve collaboration and achieve sustainable development through partnerships.

Among the CSOs involved in the review, only two out of ten had allocated budgets and implemented projects to support Partnership for Goals. The SELA organization works in partnership with the LSF organization, and TACCEI works in partnership with FEMI to implement their prioritized SDG goals. These partnerships demonstrate a positive step towards achieving SDG 17 and promoting collaboration for sustainable development.

Furthermore, based on the findings presented in Figure 10 above on Community awareness of local government

collaboration and partnership, it was revealed that a significant portion of the community members in Emboreet village are unaware of the collaboration between the LGA and other development stakeholders. This lack of awareness hinders the community's ability to actively participate in and benefit from collaborative development efforts.

To enhance the implementation of SDG 17, it is crucial for the LGA, CSOs, and NGOs to allocate resources specifically for partnership initiatives, develop concrete projects that foster collaboration, and raise awareness among the community about the ongoing collaborative initiatives. By doing so, Emboreet Village can leverage the potential of collaborations, effectively engage the community, and work more comprehensively toward reaching sustainable development goals.

Challenges and needs

The VLR conducted in Emboreet village identified several challenges in the implementation of the prioritized SDGs. Local government officials and civil society organizations (CSOs) reported financial constraints as the biggest factor affecting SDG implementation, while for community members that was exceeded by lack of meaningful stakeholder engagement (see figure 20 and 21).

Inadequate human resource with limited skilled personnel and expertise to effectively implement and monitor SDG initiatives was another major challenge affecting the implementation of SDGs in Emboreet village mentioned by the local government. Limited national government support i.e Inadequate support and guidance from national government agencies in local SDG implementation efforts, conflicting priorities resulting in competing resource allocation decisions that did not align with the SDGs, limited coordination across levels of government agencies i.e insufficient coordination and collaboration among different levels of government agencies in implementing the SDGs and lack of meaningful participation from stakeholders only were another challenges indentified by the interviewed CSOs.

Furthermore, it was identified from the review that insufficient data and information on SDG indicators and progress tracking at the local level, limited local interest i.e lack of widespread awareness and engagement among community members regarding the importance of the SDGs were also among the challenges identified by CSOs. Cultural barrier is another challenge in the implementation of the SDGs in Emboreet village. Emboreet village is the Maasai community where men have influence in decision making towards development thus this hinders implementation of some of the SDGs such as SDG4, SDG5 as well as influence of women participation in development activities.

Conflict among village leaders was another challenge that was identified by the respondents that hindered progress on the implementation of the SDGs. This was emphasized through a focus group discussion with a respondent saying *"Misunderstanding among leaders, poor leadership approach hinders progress of SDG implementation in our village as when leaders fight among themselves they also divide people and hence hindering progress."* VOLUNTARY LOCAL REVIEW (VLR) IN EMBOREET VILLAGE IN MANYARA REGION IN TANZANIA



Figure 20. Challenges affecting SDG implementation by LGA and CSOs





Priority Needs

Based on the identified challenges, certain priority needs were recognized to ensure the successful localization of SDGs. **Promoting citizen participation was the main way proposed by CSOs and the community to implement localization of the prioritized SDGs.** Community participation in SDG implementation will help create shared common goals and enhance implementation of the SDGs. Citizen participation was further emphasized during the FDG sessions with one of the participants saying "Community participation in the implementation of SDGs will create a sense of ownership to the community and hence they will value and appreciate the development initiatives conducted within the village". In contrast, revising local development plans and building capacities for effective and responsive leadership at subnational level were the main ways proposed by the local government to ensure localization of SDGs in Emboreet village (see fig. 22). Asked what the main significance of community participation in implementing SDGs is, 42% of the respondents stated that it will help solve actual problems in the community, while 25% believe the main benefit will be to create more opportunities for local socioeconomic development.







Figure 23. Significance of community participation according to survey repondents

Local Democracy and the VLR

Local governments play a crucial role in the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) ensuring that sustainable development initiatives are effectively carried out at the grassroots level. This section critically reflects on the local government's involvement in SDG implementation in Emboreet village and examines the role of local democracy in driving progress.

Efforts made by the Emboreet local government

As demonstrated in the previous chapter, Emboreet village council has made different efforts to implement SDGs in the village. Aligning the action plan with SDGs and allocating budgetary resources, mobilizing human and other resources, entering collaborations with CSOs testifies to various development initiatives on SDGs. Yet only 38% of the interviewed respondents in this study are aware of the efforts made by the local government to implement the SDGs in their community (see fig. 23), indicating a need for improved transparency and community engagement in development implementation in Emboreet village.



Figure 24. Community awareness on SDG implementation by LGA in Emboreet village

Furthermore, Table 2 shows that a significant percentage of respondents recognize the local government's efforts to ensure the provision of social services to the community, with a notable focus on promoting democratic and accountable governance. It is likely these efforts significantly contribute to achieving the SDGs, but are not explicitly recognized as such. In addition, the analysis showed that decisionmaking processes in Emboreet village exhibit a moderate level of inclusivity. While efforts are being made to involve diverse voices, there remains room for improvement in ensuring the representation of marginalized and vulnerable groups. Engaging these underrepresented segments of society will foster a more inclusive approach to SDG implementation, enabling the village to address the unique challenges faced by different communities within its boundaries.

Table 2. Emboreet community awareness of the efforts made by local government to implement SDGs

Efforts made by the local government	% of respondents
Providing democratic and accountable government for local communities	30.7%
Ensuring the provision of social services to communities in a sustainable manner	81.3%
Promoting social and economic development;	62.7%
Nurturing a safe and healthy environment;	37.3%
Looked for financial support from development partners/donors	17.3%
Others	9.3%

Community perceptions on SGD localization

Approximately 57.3% of the interviewed community members actively engage in development projects and decision-making processes, reflecting a moderate level of involvement. This suggests that while there is some participation, efforts can be made to encourage greater community engagement to ensure the SDGs align with the aspirations and needs of the villagers. Community meetings serve as a means to gather suggestions and feedback from the community regarding SDGs. Among the interviewed CSO respondents, a majority (83%) have shown commitment to localizing the SDGs, while the remaining respondents have not yet made a commitment. Additionally, 80% of the interviewed community respondents agree that the localization of SDGs is necessary. VOLUNTARY LOCAL REVIEW (VLR) IN EMBOREET VILLAGE IN MANYARA REGION IN TANZANIA





Community perception on participation in monitoring progress

Using this VLR as an example of an opportunity to participate can be indicative of the community's perception on participation in monitoring and influencing development in Emboreet. 40% of the respondents expressed their willingness to contribute to the VLR process by providing feedback and suggestions, while 14% prefer to contribute via other means such as meetings. The willingness of respondents to actively contribute to the VLR process demonstrates a collective aspiration for participatory governance.

Approximately 42% of the interviewed respondents agreed that Voluntary Local Reviews (VLRs) can help improve implementation and accountability as seen on figure 26. This shows a growing understanding within the community of how VLRs can serve as a mechanism to ensure that local initiatives align with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and that progress is monitored transparently. This was further emphasized by one of the respondents saying "VLR is important but both the community and the local government leaders should be aware of its essence". This signifies a recognition of the shared responsibility in the accountability framework. These statistics reflect the shared understanding of the importance of SDG localization and highlight the potential for active community engagement and collaboration to achieve the SDGs.

Moreover, findings of the review showed that 85% of respondents do not know and are not aware of any voluntary review or assessment conducted by the local government to evaluate SDG progress at Emboreet village

(see fig. 27). 70% of respondents indicated a need for greater transparency in the dissemination of information related to SDG progress and challenges. Strengthening these mechanisms and ensuring transparency will facilitate greater accountability and enable the community to actively participate in monitoring and evaluating SDG initiatives within the village.



Figure 26. Preferred method of community engagement in VLR







Figure 28. Community awareness of the assessment of SDG-implementation progress

Integration, monitoring and implementation

Summary of findings

This review has assessed prioritized Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) within Emboreet village, efforts made towards implementation, and the challenges encountered. It also examined the level of awareness, engagement, and perception of the community regarding the SDGs' progress. The findings and their implications are summarized below.

There is awareness on SDGs

Approximately half of the interviewed respondents in Emboreet village are aware of the SDGs though they do not really know if they are the goals and agendas set by the United Nations to be attained in 2030 or the African development agenda to be met by 2063. News reports, social media and academic institutions as well as the LGA and CSOs are raising awareness of SDGs in the community.

Commitment to SDG localization is relatively high

The Emboreet village council has demonstrated a strong commitment to localize the SDGs. By aligning the SDGs with their action plan and allocating budget for implementation, they have taken concrete steps to integrate the Sustainable Development Goals and the African development agenda into their local development priorities.

Community contribution to SDG implementation is high but should be intensified

Emboreet community members appear to be the main actors for practical development implementation in their village particularly in projects that require mobilization of resources. This engagement indicates a sense of dedication among the villagers towards achieving the sustainable development targets within their community. The majority within the community are not aware of the development initiatives done by the village council in collaboration with other development stakeholders.

Opportunities for improvement

Since half of the Emboreet community members are still unaware of SDGs and their significance, more effort to raise awareness on this aspect should be done in collaboration between CSOs, LGA and academia which could also play a role, such as with this participatory study. Enhancing transparency in SDG implementation is another area of improvement since most people in the community are unaware of the progress done by the local government in their village. Enhancing community participation and engagement by considering different groups in the society in order to promote greater inclusivity in decision-making processes remains important. Finally, ensuring mechanisms for holding the local government accountable in its progress towards the SDGs.

Means of implementation

This subsection evaluates the practical implementation of the prioritized SDGs within Emboreet village, examining the fundamental components required for the effective execution and sustainability of progress towards the targeted goals.

Financial Resources

The implementation of SDGs requires adequate financial resources to support the execution of various projects and initiatives. In Emboreet village, efforts are being made to secure funding from different sources, including revenue from the local government, central government budgets, development partners, and donor agencies. The local government has earmarked a portion of its budget towards SDG implementation. Additionally, village actively seeks Emboreet financial support through partnerships with development organizations and by exploring opportunities for grant funding. Furthermore civil society organizations in Emboreet acquire funds through partnership with development organizations and also through exploring opportunities for grant funding. These financial resources are crucial for driving sustainable development efforts and achieving the identified SDG priorities.

Multi-stakeholder partnerships

Emboreet village acknowledges the significance of engaging diverse stakeholders to harness their distinct expertise, resources, and networks. Collaborative platforms, including regular stakeholder consultations, dialogue sessions, and joint planning processes, have been instituted to cultivate inclusive decision-making and foster ownership of SDG implementation endeavors. These multi-stakeholder partnerships bolster coordination, facilitate the exchange of knowledge, and contribute to the overall efficacy and enduring nature of SDG initiatives.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the findings presented in this report highlight the Emboreet village council's commitment to aligning its development plans with the 2030 Agenda, as evident in its integration with the Tanzania Development Vision 2025 and the Five-Year Development Plan II (2016/2021). The allocation of annual budgets to prioritize certain SDGs demonstrates a proactive approach towards sustainable development. Nonetheless, the progress is challenged by various factors, including the impacts of climate change on agriculture, which pose obstacles to achieving Goals 1 and 2. Additionally, limited access to education, healthcare facilities, clean water, and inadequate road infrastructure present hurdles for specific goals such as Goal 4, Goal 5 and Goal 6. This shows the need for a holistic approach.

Despite engaging citizens through community meetings and resource mobilization for SDG implementation, it is evident that heightened awareness, engagement, and ownership within the community are needed. Furthermore, financial constraints have emerged as a significant challenge in effectively implementing the SDGs. Both the village council and community stakeholders acknowledge the pivotal roles of localization and voluntary local reviews in accelerating SDG implementation, fostering transparency, and upholding accountability.

The insights gathered from this research project provide a foundation for crafting focused strategies that empower the community and propel the village's advancement toward SDG attainment. Through active participation at every stage of this research process, Emboreet citizens were empowered, ensuring that their perspectives were valued, and their contributions acknowledged in shaping the trajectory of their community's development.

Next steps

To facilitate further progress toward the SDGs in Emboreet village, the following steps are recommended:

- Establishment of an SDG database at the local level, regulated and updated by the local authority, to facilitate access to SDG data for monitoring, evaluation, and implementation.
- Implementation of an effective monitoring and evaluation system by the local government, ensuring reliable and timely data collection to support evidence-based decision-making and track implementation progress. Implementing a robust monitoring and evaluation system will facilitate continuous tracking of progress towards the SDGs. Periodic assessments will allow stakeholders to identify challenges and make timely adjustments to strategies, ensuring that the village stays on track to achieve its sustainable development objectives.
- The Local Government Authority (LGA) and CSOs should build capacity to improve the effectiveness of SDG implementation, monitoring, and evaluation.
- The Emboreet village council should strengthen partnerships with the private sector and Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), as wellas forge new partnerships, to promote collaborative actions, attract resources, and leverage technology for accelerated SDG implementation. The village council should also establish a coordination mechanism among stakeholders to monitor implementation progress, prevent duplication of efforts and resources, and identify areas requiring further attention and implementation. This will facilitate collaboration, sharing of lessons, challenges, and good practices.
- The Emboreet village council should increase and strengthen domestic revenue sources and integrate Voluntary Local Reviews (VLRs) into SDG implementation to foster transparency and accountability.
- Emboreet village council should promote awareness and engagement on SDGs within the village, leveraging existing networks, partnerships with CSOs, media, awareness campaigns, and community meetings. Special attention should be given to children and youth as the future leaders. Collaborative efforts between the local government, academia, civil society organizations, and community leaders could me intensified utilizing the regular meetings conducted in the community, in schools and use of maasai traditional leaders to help reach a broader audience and ensure that all segments of the community are informed about the sustainable development goals and their significance.
- The Emboreet village council should work towards enhancing transparency in its SDG implementation progress. This can be achieved through regular public reporting on initiatives instead of sharing report after every six months, then can share progress report after every three months with the community and set budget allocations for SDG implementation. Additionally, establishing mechanisms for

receiving and addressing public feedback and suggestions will foster a culture of accountability.

The government of Tanzania should improve SDG data availability by fostering collaboration between the National Bureau of Statistics and the LGA by establishment of reliable statistical system at the local level, to support evidencebased decision-making and data sharing on SDGs.

The VLR report will be shared with the Emboreet village council and other community stakeholders to disseminate the research findings and gather their insights. Additionally, the publication of this report through the Swedish International Centre for Local Democracy (ICLD), contributes to international knowledge transfer and informing future interventions in the pursuit of sustainable development. The participatory video is shared with the Emboreet village council, ICLD, and the community stakeholders. This video aims to amplify community voices, raise awareness about local issues and concerns, and enhance the community's engagement and commitment to addressing the highlighted challenges.

References

- [1] M. Bexell and K. Jo[°] nsson, "Responsibility and the United Nations' Sustainable DevelopmentGoals," *Forum for Development Studies*, pp. 13-29, 2017.
- [2] A. Mortimer, I. Ahmed, T. Johnson, L. Tang and M. Alston, "Localizing Sustainable Development Goal 13 on Climate Actionto Build Local Resilience to Floods in the Hunter Valley: A Literature Review," *Sustainability*, p. 5565, 2023.
- [3] P. S. Reddy, "Localising the sustainable development goals (SDGs)," *African journal of Public Affairs, Volume 9,* 2016.
- [4] United Nations, "Voluntary Local Reviews," UN, [Online]. Available: https://sdgs.un.org/topics/voluntary-local-reviews. [Accessed 10 July 2023].
- [5] C. Kienast-von Einem, "Volunatry Local Review of Mwanza: A review of the implementation of the SDGs," UN Habitat, 2023.
- [6] E. Bilsky, A. C. Moreno and A. F. Tortosa, "Local Governments and SDG Localisation: Reshaping Multilevel Governance from the Bottom up," *Human Development and Capabilities,* vol. 22 issue4, no. 713-724, 2021.
- [7] T. Osman, E. Kenawy, K. I. Abdrabo, D. Shaw, A. Alshamndy, M. Elsharif, M. Salem, M. Alwetaishi, R. M. Aly and B. Elboshy, "Voluntary Local Review Framework to Monitor and Evaluate the Progress towards Achieving Sustainable Development Goals at a City Level: Buraidah City, KSA and SDG11 as A Case Study," *Sustainability*, vol. 13(17), 2021.
- [8] C. Meschede and A. Mainka, "Including citizen participation formats for drafting and implementing local sustainable development strategies," *Urban Science*, vol. 4(1)3, 2020.
- [9] European Union, I. Niestroy, E. Hege, E. Dirth, . R. Zondervan and K. Derr, "Europe's approach to implementing the Sustainable Development Goals: good practices and the way forward," European Union, 2019.
- [10] O. V. Ajulor, "The Challenges of Policy Implementation in Africa and Sustainable Development Goals. PEOPLE," International Journal of Social Sciences, vol. 3(3), pp. 1497-1518, 2018.
- [11] M. Bexell, M. and K. Jönsson, "Responsibility and the United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals," *Forum for Development Studies*, vol. 44(1), pp. 13-29, 2016.
- [12] E. A. Moallemi, S. Malekpour, M. Hadjikakou, R. Raven, K. Szetey, D. Ningrum, A. Dhiaulhaq and B. A. Bryan, "Achieving the Sustainable Development Goals Requires Transdisciplinary Innovation at the Local Scale," *One Earth*, vol. 3, no. 3, pp. 300-313, 2020.
- [13] . B. R. Swain and F. Yang-Wallentin, "Achieving sustainable development goals:predicaments and strategies," International Journal of Sustainable Development & World Ecology, vol. 27:2, pp. 96-106, 2019.
- [14] L. Criscuolo, A. L'Astorina, R. van der Wal and L. C. Gray, "Recent contributions of citizen science on sustainability policies: A critical review," *Current Opinion in Environmental Science & Health*, vol. 31, p. 100423, 2023,.
- [15] S. Croese, M. Oloko, D. Simon and S. C. Valencia, "Bringing the Global to the Local: the challenges of multi-level governance for global policy implementation in Africa," *International Journal of Urban Sustainable Development*, vol. 13, no. 3, 2021.
- [16] M. Mohieldin , S. Wahba , M. A. Gonzalez-Perez and . M. Shehata, "The Role of Local and Regional Governments in the SDGs: The Localization Agenda," in *Business, Government and the SDGs*, Springer., 2023, pp. 105-137.
- [17] Policy Forum Local Governance Working Group (LGWG), "National Five Years Development II (FYDPII): How Do We Improve Implementation in the Local Government Authorities?," 2017.
- [18] P. Tidemand and J. Msami, "The Impact of Local Government reforms in Tanzania 1998-2008," Research and Poverty Alleviation (REPOA), 2010.
- [19] N. B. o. Statisics, "Tanzania 2022 census," 2022.
- [20] "Commonwealth Local Government Forum," 6 July 2023. [Online]. Available: https://www.clgf.org.uk/regions/ clgf-east-africa/tanzania/.
- [21] U. r. o. Tanzania, "Voluntary National Review (VNR)," 2019.
- [22] United Nations, "Sustainable Development Goals," 14 January 2023. [Online]. Available: https://sdgs.un.org/goals.
- [23] F. Ortiz-Moya and . M. Reggiani, "Contributions of the voluntary local review process to policy integration: evidence from frontrunner cities," *urban sustainability*, 2023.
- [24] "Voluntary local reviews," UN, July 2023. [Online]. Available: https://sdgs.un.org/topics/voluntary-local-reviews.

Annex 1

Questionnaire for Local Voluntary Review of Sustainable Development Goals at the Community Level

A. **GENERAL INFORMATION**

- 1. Name of respondent.....
- 3. Marital status of respondent.....
 - Married
 - Single
 - Divorced
 - Others (specify).....

4. Level of education of respondent

- No formal education
- Primary education
- Secondary education
- \square Tertiary education

5. Employing sector of the respondent

- Employed in the public sector
- Employed in the private sector
- Self-employed
- Not employed

B. LOCALIZATION AND IMPLEMENTATION OF SDGs AT COMMUNITY LEVEL

6. Are you aware/familiar with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) set by the United Nations?

- Yes
- No

7. How aware are you of the SDGs?) (more than one answer)

- No Poverty Climate Change Zero Hunger Life below the water Good Health and Well-Being Life on land Quality Education Peace justice and strong institution
- Gender Equality
- Clean Water and Sanitation
- Affordable and Clean Energy
- Decent Work and Economic Growth
- Industry, Innovation, and Infrastructure
- **Reduced Inequalities**
- Sustainable Cities and Communities

Partnerships for goals

-

8. Where did you learn about the SDGs? (more than one answer)	
□ National Local governments associations (ALAT) or international local governments networks (UCLC	j
Africa, Citynet, etc.)	
 Ministries, Departments, and Agencies (MDAs) Development partners/donor agencies 	
 Academic/Research institutes 	
\Box CSO/NGOs	
 Local and/or international news reporters (i.e., TV, social media, etc.) Others (please specify) 	
9. What are the top three SDGs that should be prioritized for your village/ward?	
10. How do you think these priorities align with the needs and aspirations of your village/ward?	
11. Are you aware of any efforts made by your local government to implement the SDGs?	
\Box Yes <i>(go to question no. 4.1)</i> \Box No \Box I don't know.	
12. If YES in QN 9, what are those efforts? (more than one answer)	
 Providing democratic and accountable government for local communities Ensuring the provision of social services to communities in a sustainable manner Promoting social and economic development; Number of a soft and healthe agriculture manner 	
 Nurturing a safe and healthy environment; Looked for financial support from development partners/donors 	
 Doked for matchai support from development partners/ donors Others (please specify) 	
13. How are you involved in implementing the SDGs in your community?	
	•
14. Through which activities or programs does your community contribute to achieving SDGs? (more than one answer)	
D Promote peer-to-peer learning	
 Exchange good practices and information 	
 Conduct capacity-building, awareness raising and/or communication campaigns. Participation initiatives of grassroots institutions in SDG-related activities 	
 Interpreter interpreter inter	
$\Box \text{Alignment of local development plans}$	
□ Citizen participation	
□ Needs assessment	
Others (please specify)	
40 SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL CENTRE FOR LOCAL DEMOCRACY	

15. What are the significant benefits for community members to be involved in implementing SDGs? (More than answer)

- \Box Solve the actual problems in the community
- □ Create more opportunities for local socio-economic development
- □ Gain more knowledge and capability for sustainable development
- □ Interlinkages with various stakeholders (public, private, and people)
- □ Others (please specify.....)

16. What are your perceptions on SDGs implementation in your community?

.....

17. In general, what do you think about the localization of SDGs in your community (only one answer)

- \Box Very necessary
- □ Necessary
- \Box Less necessary
- \Box Not necessary at all
- \Box I don't know

Reasons:

18. What are the main challenges for implementing and localizing the SDG at the local government

□ Financial limitation

level (more than one answer)

- □ Lack of meaningful participation from stakeholders (i.e., NGOs, private sector, etc.)
- □ Limited national government support
- □ Limited local interest
- \Box Availability of SDG data

Others (please specify).....

19. What are your suggestions on how to enhance community participation and engagement in SDG-related activities?

.....

C. COMMUNITY GRASSROOTS INITIATIVES

20. Are there any community-led initiatives or projects related to the SDGs in your village?

- □ Yes
- □ No

If yes, please describe the initiatives and their impact on the village.

Initiatives	Initiative Description	Levels of impact Very High High Moderate Low Very Low

D. COLLABORATION AND PARTNERSHIPS:

21. Has the local government collaborated with other stakeholders or organizations to support SDG implementation in your village?

- □ Yes
- □ No

b. If yes, please provide examples of such collaborations and partnerships

.....

22. What are the contributions of these collaborations and partnerships in implementing SDG in your village/ward?

.....

E. SDG MONITORING AND REPORTING

23. Are you aware of any voluntary reviews or assessments conducted by your local government to evaluate SDG progress?

- □ Yes
- □ No

24. Does the local government regularly share information and report on the progress of SDG implementation in your village?

- □ Yes
- \Box No

25. Do you believe that a voluntary review of the SDGs at the local government level can help improve implementation and accountability?

- \Box Strongly agree
- □ Agree
- □ Neutral
- □ Disagree
- □ Strongly disagree

26. How would you like to contribute to the local voluntary review process of the SDGs?

- □ Participate in stakeholder consultations.
- \Box Provide feedback and suggestions.
- □ Volunteer for SDG-related projects.
- □ Other (please specify).....

Thank you for taking the time to complete this questionnaire. Your input will help assess the voluntary Local Review of Sustainable Development Goals at your community level.

Annex 2



CLD International t Centrum for Local Demokrati



Voluntary Local Review (VLR) Report for Tanzania in 2023

Questionnaire

This questionnaire is part of the Voluntary Local Review (VLR) Report for Tanzania under the support of the Swedish International c e n t e r f o r L o c a 1 D e m o c r a c y (ICLD) in collaboration with the Institute of Development Studies(IDS), University of Dar es Salaam in Tanzania. There is a thinking from general global observation that community members are not given enough space to participate in the realization of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) while in deed are at the pivot in the course of achieving the SDG Agenda by year 2030 as planned.

This study therefore, aims at gathering information from the grassroots level in LGAs on the level at which the national Government in Tanzania has been able to respond to and transcend the implementation of the SDG Agenda in its matrix of governance and development in practice. There three tiers of governance in Tanzania namely the National Government, Regional Administration and Local Government Authorities.

In so doing, gathering of information is on course from a sample of selected Regions and LGAs of which Manyara region under Simanjiro district council and Emboreet ward are among the selected for this study to determine the extent at which Tanzania has proliferated the SDG Protocol it entered down to the people – centred level in rural and urban areas where they live-in. Team of experts are deployed to the designated areas for that purpose who will conduct interviews, physical and or virtual consultations, email contacts and all other possible means with government officials and other relevant stakeholders in order to get meaningful responses based on the guiding issues which basically are inclined on SDG Agenda in favour of the country as given in the questionnaire.

Deadline: Please submit to us by 16th June, 2023.

For more clarification, please contact Ms.Asia Majid (Mobile No: +255-767- 364957) via e-mail: majid.asia@hotmail.com or igangula.asia@udsm.ac.tz OR Dr.Gelas Rubakula (mobile no:+255756077862) email; <u>gelas.hiel@gmail.com</u> or <u>rubakula.gelas@udsm.ac.tz</u>

Thank you for your attention.

Guidance in filling the questionnaire:

This questionnaire has Five major sections;

- 2) Notable areas in the questionnaire:
 - a) Option (yes/no/unknown): select one by checking on the provided section;
 - b) Item selection: select one or more relevant answer by checking on the provided section;
 - c) Open question: please fill in the relevant answers;

Tentative time to spend in filling out the questionnaire: about 40 minutes; and 4)
 Respondents' answers are and will only be used for the purpose of this study.

. Respondents answers are and wintenty be used for the purpo

A. GENERAL INFORMATION

This	Survey is filled by:	Regional Administration Local Government Authority CSO
	e of Organization/Institution esented	
Phys	sical address of Organization	
Abo	ut the respondent	
1	Name	
2	Position	
3	Gender	
4	Name of Unit/Office	
5	e-mail and Phone number	
Date	of filling out the questionnaire	

B. LOCALIZATION OF SDGs AT REGIONAL/SUB-NATIONAL GOVERNMENT/LGA/CSO

1. Please provide actual Total Annual Budget for your organization

	2019/20	2021/22	2022/23
Total annual budget			

- How familiar with the SDGs would you say your organization is? (<u>please select only one option</u>)
 Very few individuals in the organization are familiar with the SDGs
 - Many have heard about the SDGs but are not aware about their relevance
 - □ The majority of our staff is aware and refers to the SDGs, but it is not high in our work priorities
 - The SDGs are well known in our organization and used as an important reference in our development plan, investment plan and/or strategies

I don't know

3.Where did you (or your colleagues) learn about the SDGs? (more than one answer)

 National Local governments associations (ALAT) or international local governments networks (UCLG Africa, Citynet, etc)

☐Ministries,

Departments and Agencies (MD

Development partners/donor agencies

□Academic/Research institutes

□CSO/NGOs

□Local and/or international news reporters (i.e., TV, social medias, etc.)

Others (please specify)

3. Has your LGA/Regional Administration/CSO adopted a commitment to localize the SDGs?

- □ Yes (go to question no. 4.1) □ No
- I don't know
- 4.1. If YES, what are those commitments? (more than one answer)
- Delivered an official statement
- Prioritized the SDGs for your LGA/Regional government
- Aligned the SDGs in the action plan and budget allocation
- Developed indicators of SDGs for your LGA/Region to assess progress eg G/S Maps of LGAs and rapid proliferation of Emerging Small Towns
- Looked for financial support from development partners/donors
- Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 1: No Povertv</u> in your LGA/CSO or Region (it can be from national government, NGOs, development partners, etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources budget	of	Target SDGs
1						
2						
3						

 Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 2:Zero hunder</u> in your LGA/CSO or Region (it can be from national government, NGOs, development partners, etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources of budget	Target SDGs
1					
2					
3					

		1
		1
		1
		1

 Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 3: Good Health and</u> <u>Well-beings</u> in your LGA or Region (it can be from national government, NGOs, development partners, etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources budget	of	Target SDGs
1						
2						
3						

 Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 4: Quality Education</u> in your LGA/CSO or Region (it can be from national government, NGOs, development partners, etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources budget	of	Target SDGs
1						
2						
3						

 Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 5: Gender equality</u> in your LGA/CSO or Region (it can be from national government, NGOs, development partners, etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources of budget	Target SDGs
1					
2					
3					

 Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 6: Clean water and</u> <u>sanitation</u> in your LGA/CSO or Region (it can be from national government, NGOs, development partners, etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources budget	of	Target SDGs
1						
2						
3						

 Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 7: Affordable and</u> <u>clean energy</u> in your LGA/CSO or Region (it can be from national government, NGOs, development partners, etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources budget	of	Target SDGs
1						
2						
3						

 Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 9: Industry.</u> <u>Innovation & infrastructure</u> in your LGA or Region (It can be from national government, NGOs, development partners, etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources budget	of	Target SDGs
1						
2						
3						

 Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 10: Reduced</u> <u>inequalities</u> in your LGA/CSO or Region (it can be from national government, NGOs, development partners, etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources budget	of	Target SDGs
1						
2						
3						

 Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 11: Sustainable Cities</u> and <u>Communities</u> in your LGA or Region (it can be from national government, NGOs, development partners, etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources budget	of	Target SDGs
1						
2						
3						

 Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 13: Climate Action</u> in your LGA/CSO or Region (it can be from national government, NGOs, development partners, etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources budget	of	Target SDGs
1						
2						
3						

 Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 16: Peace, justice</u> and strong institutions in your LGA/CSO or Region (it can be from national government, NGOs, development partners,

etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources o budget	f Target SDGs
1					
2					
3					

 Please list down the projects, programs, or activities related to <u>SDG 17: Partnership for</u> <u>Goals</u> in your LGA/CSO or Region (it can be from national government, NGOs, development partners,

etc.) (if any)

No.	Name of projects/programs/activities	Period (year)	Budget (USD)	Sources budget	of	Target SDGs
1						
2						
3						

- What kind of activities or programs that your organization (LGA or Region) contribute to achieve the implementation of SDGs? (more than one answer)
 - Promote peer-to-peer learning
 - Exchange good practices and information
 - □ Conduct capacity building, awareness raising and/or communication campaigns
 - Participation initiatives of grassroots institutions in SDG related activities
 - Mobilize local resources
 - Alignment of local development plans
 - Citizen participation
 - Needs assessment

What do you think are the significant benefits for your LGA/CSO or Region from working towards the achievement of the SDGs? (more than one answer)

- Solve the actual problems our LGA or Regional context
- Diversify sources of funds for investment and development
- Interlinkages with various stakeholders (public, private and people)
- Create more opportunities for local socio-economic development
- Understand better for long-term local development framework (more cost-effective)
- Gain more knowledge and capability for sustainable development
- Others (please specify......)

19. What are the main challenges for implementing the SDGs in your LGA/CSO or Region so far?

(more than one answer)

- Financial limitation
- Conflicting prioritieS
- Inadequate human resources
- Lack of meaningful participation from stakeholders (i.e., NGOs, private sector, etc.)
- Limited national government support
- Limited coordination across levels of government agencies
- Limited local interest
- Availability of SDG data
- In general, what do you think about localization of SDGs in your organization as well as your LGA/Region? (only one answer)
 - Very necessary
 - Necessary
 - Less necessary
 - Not necessary at all
 - I don't know

Reasons:

C. IMPACT OF COVID-19 PANDEMIC TOWARDS THE SDGs LOCALIZATION EFFORT AT THE GRASSROOTS LEVEL

21. Which SDGs are considered as the top priorities to be implemented in your LGA/CSO/Region post COVID-19 pandemic?

SDGs	Instruction: Please writing SDG number (i.e., SDG 5) that you think they are the top 10 most important goals in order.	Levels of difficulty to achieve 1. Very difficult 2. Moderate 3. Easy 4. I don't know
Priority Goal No. 1:		
Priority Goal No. 2:		
Priority Goal No. 3:		
Priority Goal No. 4:		
Priority Goal No. 5:		
Priority Goal No. 6:		
Priority Goal No. 7:		
Priority Goal No. 8:		

D. FUTURE IMPLICATIONS

22. What are the necessary adjustments to ensure a successful localization of SDGs in your

LGA/Region? (more than one answer)

- Revise the local development plans
- Build capacities for effective and responsive leadership at subnational level
- Promote multi-level and multi-stakeholder mechanism
- Promote the exchange of best practices
- □ Promote bottom-up approaches
- Promote citizen participation
- □ Apply for grants and/or loan from development partners and/or donor agencies
- □ Align local and national plans with the SDGs □
- Increase local taxes

Others (please specify......)

E. MONITORING, EVALUATION, AND REPORTING

23. How does the monitoring and evaluation is carried out? (you may answer more than one option)

- Periodic reporting, at least once every 6 months
- Analysis of the report
- Target adjustment
- Indicator changes

Thank you for devoting precious your time



Swedish International Centre for Local Democracy